

**Amended with leave pursuant to Rule 75 and
the Order of Harrington J dated May 21, 2015**

Court File No. T-2506-14

FEDERAL COURT

e-document	T-2506-14	
F I L E D	FEDERAL COURT COUR FÉDÉRALE May 25, 2015 Julia Orchard Vancouver, BC	D É P O S É

ANIZ ALANI

Applicant

and

THE PRIME MINISTER OF CANADA,
THE GOVERNOR GENERAL OF CANADA and
THE QUEEN'S PRIVY COUNCIL FOR CANADA

Respondents

AMENDED NOTICE OF APPLICATION

TO THE RESPONDENTS:

A PROCEEDING HAS BEEN COMMENCED by the applicant. The relief claimed by the applicant appears on the following page.

THIS APPLICATION will be heard by the Court at a time and place to be fixed by the Judicial Administrator. Unless the Court orders otherwise, the place of hearing will be as requested by the applicant. The applicant requests that this application be heard at the Federal Court in Vancouver, British Columbia.

IF YOU WISH TO OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION, to receive notice of any step in the application or to be served with any documents in the application, you or a solicitor acting for you must prepare a notice of appearance in Form 305 prescribed by the *Federal Courts Rules* and serve it on the applicant's solicitor, or where the applicant is self-represented, on the applicant, WITHIN 10 DAYS after being served with this notice of application.

Copies of the *Federal Courts Rules* information concerning the local offices of the Court and other necessary information may be obtained on request to the

Administrator of this Court at Ottawa (telephone 613-992-4238) or at any local office.

IF YOU FAIL TO OPPOSE THIS APPLICATION, JUDGMENT MAY BE GIVEN IN YOUR ABSENCE AND WITHOUT FURTHER NOTICE TO YOU.

Date:

Issued by: _____
(Registry Officer)

Address of local office: Federal Court
 Courts Administration Service
 P.O. Box 11065, 3rd Floor
 701 West Georgia Street
 Vancouver, BC V7Y 1B6

TO:

THE PRIME MINISTER OF CANADA
80 Wellington Street
Ottawa, ON K1A 0A2

THE QUEEN'S PRIVY COUNCIL FOR CANADA
85 Sparks Street
Ottawa, ON K1A 0A3

THE GOVERNOR GENERAL OF CANADA
1 Sussex Drive
Ottawa, ON K1A 0A1

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF CANADA
284 Wellington St.
Ottawa, ON K1A 0H8

DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE CANADA
British Columbia Regional Office
900 - 840 Howe Street
Vancouver, British Columbia
V6Z 2S9

APPLICATION

THIS IS AN APPLICATION FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW in respect of the decision of the Prime Minister, as communicated publicly on December 4, 2014, not to advise the Governor General to summon fit and qualified Persons to fill existing Vacancies in the Senate.

THE APPLICANT makes application for:

- 1) A declaration that:
 - a) the Prime Minister of Canada must advise the Governor General to summon a qualified Person to the Senate within a reasonable time after a Vacancy happens in the Senate.
 - ~~b) the deliberate failure to advise the Governor General to summon a fit and qualified Person to fill a Vacancy in the Senate within a reasonable time after the Vacancy happens~~
 - ~~i) is contrary to section 32 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*;~~
 - ~~ii) is contrary to section 22 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*~~
 - ~~(1) to the extent the Vacancies when considered in the aggregate deny a province or territory of the proportion of regional representation set out in section 22 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*, and~~
 - ~~(2) to the extent that a Vacancy deprives a province or territory of the minimum number of representatives in the Senate set out in section 22 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*;~~
 - ~~iii) undermines and breaches the principles of~~
 - ~~(1) federalism,~~
 - ~~(2) democracy,~~

~~(3) constitutionalism,~~

~~(4) the rule of law, and~~

~~(5) the protection of minorities,~~

~~and underlying constitutional imperatives, as enunciated by the
Supreme Court of Canada in *the Quebec Secession Reference*; and~~

~~iv) is unlawful absent an amendment to the Constitution of Canada according
to the constitutional formula as set out in section 41 of the *Constitution
Act, 1982*;~~

- 2) An Order for costs of this application on a basis that this Honourable Court deems just; and
- 3) Such further or other relief as this Honourable Court deems just.

THE GROUNDS for the application are:

- 1) Section 32 of the *Constitution Act, 1867* provides:

“When a Vacancy happens in the Senate by Resignation, Death, or otherwise, the Governor General shall by Summons to a fit and qualified person fill the Vacancy.”
- 2) Section 21 of the *Constitution Act, 1867* provides that “[t]he Senate shall, subject to the Provisions of this Act, consist of One Hundred and five Members, who shall be styled Senators.”
- 3) There are currently ~~46~~ 20 Vacancies in the Senate.
- 4) There are currently 85 Senators in the Senate, not excluding suspensions.
- 5) Of the 105 Senate positions, the constitutionally established allocation and the currently existing actual distribution among the provinces and territories, not excluding suspensions, are as follows:

Province or Territory	Number of Senators Allocated by Section 22 of <i>Constitution Act, 1867</i>	Actual Current Distribution of Senators	Current Vacancies
Ontario	24	18	6
Quebec	24	19	5
Nova Scotia	10	8	2
New Brunswick	10	8	2
Prince Edward Island	4	3	1
Manitoba	6	3	3
British Columbia	6	5	1
Saskatchewan	6	6	0
Alberta	6	6	0
Newfoundland and Labrador	6	6	0
Yukon Territory	1	1	0
Northwest Territories	1	1	0
Nunavut	1	1	0
Total	105	85	20

- 6) The Senate has not had 105 appointed Senators since September 6, 2012.
- 7) No person has been appointed to the Senate since March 25, 2013.
- 8) Vacancies happen in the Senate upon the resignation, death, or disqualification of a Senator, when a Senator reaches the age of 75, and upon the addition of four or eight Senators where permitted by section 26 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*.
- 9) The text of section 24 of the *Constitution Act, 1867* provides for the formal appointment of Senators by the Governor General:

24. The Governor General shall from Time to Time, in the Queen's Name, by Instrument under the Great Seal of Canada, summon qualified Persons to the Senate; and, subject to the Provisions of this Act, every Person so summoned shall become and be a Member of the Senate and a Senator.
- 10) In the *Senate Reform Reference*, the Supreme Court of Canada confirmed: "In

practice, constitutional convention requires the Governor General to follow the recommendations of the Prime Minister of Canada when filling Senate vacancies.”

- ~~11) By constitutional convention, appointments to the Senate are made on the advice of the Prime Minister.~~
- 12) The Prime Minister’s decision not to recommend appointments to the Senate to fill the Vacancies reflects an impermissible attempt to make changes to the Senate without undertaking the constitutional reforms required in light of the amending formula set out in the *Constitution Act, 1982* as interpreted by the Supreme Court of Canada in the *Senate Reform Reference*.
- 13) The failure to summon a fit and qualified Person to fill a Vacancy in the Senate within a reasonable time after the Vacancy happens undermines and breaches sections 21, 22 and 32 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*, and the principles of federalism, democracy, constitutionalism and the rule of law, and the protection of minorities, and underlying constitutional imperatives, as enunciated by the Supreme Court of Canada in the *Quebec Secession Reference*.
- 14) Section 18(1) of the *Federal Courts Act* grants the Federal Court exclusive jurisdiction to grant declaratory relief against any federal board, commission or other tribunal, and to hear and determine any application or other proceeding for relief against a federal board, commission or other tribunal.
- 15) Section 18.1(3) of the *Federal Courts Act* empowers the Federal Court to order a federal board, commission or other tribunal to do any act or thing it has unlawfully failed or refused to do or has unreasonably delayed in doing.
- 16) The Prime Minister, or alternatively the Queen’s Privy Council for Canada acting on the recommendation of the Prime Minister, is a federal board, commission or other tribunal, being a body, person or persons having, exercising or purporting to exercise jurisdiction or powers conferred by or

under an order made pursuant to a prerogative of the Crown, when providing advice to the Governor General regarding the appointment of Senators.

- 17) Such further and other grounds as the applicant may identify and this Honourable Court may consider.

THIS APPLICATION will be supported by the following material:

- 1) Affidavit of Ashley Morton, sworn January 16, 2015, and served;
- 2) Affidavit of Aniz Alani;
- 3) The record before the Prime Minister of Canada in determining when, if at all, to fill each of the currently existing Vacancies in the Senate; and
- 4) Such further and other material as the applicant may advise and this Honourable Court may allow.

THE APPLICANT REQUESTS the Prime Minister of Canada to send a certified copy of the record of all materials placed before and considered by the Prime Minister of Canada and the Queen's Privy Council for Canada in making the decision not to advise the Governor General to fill the currently existing Vacancies, to the applicant and to the Registry.

Dated at Vancouver, British Columbia this 8th day of December, 2014.

Amended: May 25, 2015



ANIZ ALANI, on his own behalf



Tel: (604) 600-1156

E-Mail: senate.vacancies@anizalani.com